

Contents

Página

INTRODUCTION	15
--------------------	----

PART ONE

1

FREE OR AT A PRICE? CONCERNING THE HUMAN BODY AS A RESOURCE	23
--	-----------

MARÍA CASADO

1. Introduction	23
2. The distance between prescriptions and practices	24
<i>Egg donation</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Surrogate motherhood</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>Organ donation</i>	<i>29</i>
<i>Blood donation</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>Research with human beings, biological samples and health data</i>	<i>31</i>
3. Two conflicting models: dignity and rights v market society ...	32
4. Some thoughts about justice and the consideration of the body as a resource	35

2

THE RIGHT TO ONE'S OWN BODY (BODILY INTEGRITY) AND ITS CONSEQUENCES	39
--	-----------

MANUEL ATIENZA

1	39
----------------	-----------

7

	<i>Página</i>
2	41
2.1	41
2.2	44
3	48
4	52
5	55
5.1	55
5.2	57
5.3	59
6	61
Sources consulted	61

3

SUBJECT, BODY AND MARKET: A COMPLEX RELATIONSHIP 65

ANA RUBIO

1. Introduction	65
2. The modern legal and political discourse and capital/the market	67
3. What structural changes should legal and political culture undertake in order to overcome origins-based oppression? ...	71
4. The political and ethical value of the modern discourse	78
5. The commercialization and fragmentation of bodies	79
6. Body-subjects and citizenship	83
7. What mistakes have we made and are we still making?	86
8. Unexpected problems and future challenges	87
Sources Consulted	90

4

IS THERE ANYTHING MONEY CAN'T BUY? 93

ALBERT ROYES

8

5

IS MY BODY MINE? CONCERNING THE PRIVATE OWNERSHIP OF THE HUMAN BODY 101

RICARDO GARCÍA MANRIQUE

1. The human body, tempted by the market	101
2. My body is mine	106
<i>Ownership</i>	106
<i>My body is mine and not yours</i>	107
<i>Is my body mine?</i>	108
3. My body and I: do I have a body or am I a body?	109
<i>The parts of my body and I</i>	111
4. The ownership of oneself, or self-ownership	112
<i>Nozick and self-ownership</i>	112
<i>What Locke says</i>	115
<i>Is Nozick wrong?</i>	118
<i>Is Cohen wrong?</i>	118
5. My body is nobody's	123
Sources consulted	125

6

BETWEEN PROPERTY AND PERSONALITY: THE RIGHT TO DISPOSE OF PARTS AND PRODUCTS OF THE BODY FROM A CIVIL LAW PERSPECTIVE 129

ESTHER ARROYO AMAYUELAS

1. Introduction	129
2. Between the right of ownership and the right of personality ...	130
2.1. <i>Ownership of the body or of its separate parts?</i>	130
2.2. <i>Or a right of personality and self-determination?</i>	133
2.3. <i>Some difficult cases</i>	134
2.3.1. <i>The destruction of male genetic material</i>	135
2.3.2. <i>The disposal of gametes and embryos</i>	136



3. The fact that financial gain is prohibited does not imply that the disposal of organs, tissues or fluids is prohibited	138
3.1. <i>Compensation for the discomfort caused</i>	140
3.2. <i>The problem of transparency</i>	142
4. Conclusion	146

7

NOTES ON THE HUMAN BODY AND ITS PARTS IN THE MARKET	147
--	-----

SALVADOR DARÍO BERGEL

1. Introduction	147
2. The human body and the person	148
3. The new panorama	150
4. Human body parts, substances and waste	154
5. The different positions concerning the situation of the separate parts of the body in legal systems	155
5.1. <i>Situation in the orbit of patrimonial rights</i>	156
5.2. <i>“The personality rights approach”</i>	158
5.3. <i>Alternative approaches</i>	160
6. Importance of the genetic information of detached body parts	161
7. Ends pursued with the detachment of body parts and the applicable legal regime	164
7.1. <i>The sale of parts of the body</i>	164
7.2. <i>Donation</i>	166
7.2.1. <i>Donation for transplants</i>	166
7.2.2. <i>Donation for scientific purposes</i>	166
7.3. <i>Preservation of the material given by the donor for later use</i> ...	166
8. The contradictions arising from the new reality	167
9. The principle of non-commerciality of the body: its sources and scope	170
10. The separate and industrialized parts: their regime	173
11. The artificial parts incorporated in the body	175

10



PART TWO

8

SHOULD SURROGACY BE PERMITTED IN SPAIN? THE STATE OF THE QUESTION AND SOME CONSIDERATIONS ... 179

ESTHER FARNÓS AMORÓS

1. Surrogacy today	179
2. Different approaches to the same phenomenon, the boom in international surrogacy and a “liberalizing” trend	183
3. The situation in Spain	187
1. <i>The point of departure: nullity of the agreement and “cross-border reproduction”</i>	187
2. <i>The Resolution of the Directorate General of Registries and Notaries of 18 February 2009</i>	189
2.1. Precedents and the progress of the case	189
2.2. Surrogacy before the Supreme Court	191
2.2.1. Sound judgment in the methodology and the more debatable nature of the substantive arguments	191
2.2.2. Surrogacy contrary to the Spanish international public order	193
2.2.3. Absence of discrimination	194
2.2.4. The best interests of the child	195
2.3. Where are we?	198
4. Surrogacy before the European Court of Human Rights: possible implications for Spain	200
5. Final considerations	204
1. <i>Moral and bioethical neutrality</i>	204
2. <i>Should surrogacy be permitted in Spain?</i>	206
Sources consulted	212



9

ORGAN AND TISSUE DONATION AND TRANSPLANTATION: ALTRUISM OR BUSINESS?	219
CHLOË LLESTÉ	
1. Introduction	219
2. Definitions	221
3. Illicit organ trafficking practices	222
<i>Living donors in their own country</i>	225
<i>Living donors travelling to the recipient's own country</i>	226
<i>Transplants performed in third countries with living donors</i>	226
<i>Inclusion on foreign waiting lists</i>	226
<i>Manipulation of waiting lists</i>	227
<i>Cadaveric donors on demand</i>	227
<i>Regulated compensation of living and cadaveric donation</i>	227
4. Prices and fees	228
5. Ethical conclusions and assessments	228
Sources consulted	229

10

THE COMMERCIALIZATION OF GENETICS	233
CARME BARROT	
1. Using genetics to diagnose diseases	233
<i>Family ties</i>	234
<i>Doctor-patient relationship</i>	235
<i>Genetic counselling</i>	235
<i>Conclusions</i>	236
2. Forensic genetics	236
<i>Forensic genetic testing on the Internet</i>	236
<i>The identity of the professionals</i>	237
<i>Paternity report</i>	237
<i>Conclusions</i>	238
Sources consulted	238

12



11

EMERGENT RESEARCH AND MARKETS: WEBSITES, APPS, BIG DATA, BIOLOGICAL SAMPLES AND GENETIC INFORMATION 241

MÍRIAM MÉNDEZ GARCÍA

Introduction 241

1. Analysis of research projects with websites and apps 243

2. Treatment of international requests for samples 243

3. Requests for samples through intermediary companies 244

4. Requests for samples for technical validations and other external requests 244

5. Requests for extraordinary use of biological samples 245

6. Big data and genetic information projects 248

Sources Consulted 248

12

THE TREND TOWARDS THE COMMERCIALIZATION OF HUMAN BODY PARTS AND OF PRIVACY IN RESEARCH WITH BIOLOGICAL SAMPLES AND DATA (BIG AND SMALL) 251

ITZIAR DE LECUONA

1. Introduction 251

2. Public assets at the service of private interests? 254

3. Part I: Biological samples of human origin and biobanks 256

4. Part II: Big data analysis applied to research (big data) and health apps (*mHealth*) 265

5. Conclusions and proposals 273

NOTE ON THE AUTHORS 277

Thomson Reuters ProView. Guía de uso